

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

-----	X
	:
THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY,	:
	:
Plaintiff,	: No. 07 Civ. 8379 (RJS)
	:
vs.	: ECF Case
	:
ULTREO, INC.,	:
	:
Defendant.	:
-----	:
	X

PLAINTIFF THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY'S PRE-TRIAL BRIEF

HAROLD K. GORDON (HG-1007)
LAURA W. SAWYER (LS-4386)
JONES DAY
222 East 41st Street
New York, NY 10017-6702
212-326-3939

JOHN B. WILLIAMS (pro hac vice)
DANIELLE M. HOHOS (pro hac vice)
JONES DAY
51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20001-2113
202-879-3939

Attorneys for Plaintiff
The Procter & Gamble Company

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT	1
II. ULTREO’S FALSE AND MISLEADING ADVERTISING CAMPAIGN	4
III. ULTREO’S FALSE AND MISLEADING CLAIMS SHOULD BE ENJOINED.....	7
A. Express False Claims	7
B. Establishment Claims.....	9
C. Implied Claims.....	10
IV. ULTREO’S CHANGING POSITION REGARDING THE NEED FOR CLINICAL STUDIES	13
A. Ultreo Has Previously Recognized The Need For Clinical Studies	14
B. Ultreo Has Tried, and Failed, to Obtain Clinical Support	15
C. There Is No Industry Standard That In Vitro Tests Are Sufficient.....	16
D. Courts Recognize that In Vitro Tests Are Insufficient To Show the Effect of a Product in Actual Use	17
V. “UNCLEAN HANDS” IS NOT A BAR TO P&G’S RELIEF.....	17
VI. P&G’S “DELAY” TO COLLECT SCIENTIFIC AND CONSUMER EVIDENCE WAS REASONABLE	19
VII. P&G IS LIKELY TO SUFFER IRREPARABLE INJURY	20
VIII. RELIEF SOUGHT BY P&G	22

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

960 F.2d at 299	11
<i>Abbott Labs. v. Mead Johnson & Co.</i> , 971 F.2d 6, 10 (7th Cir.1992)	8
<i>Advanced Magnetic Closures, Inc. v. Rome Fastener Corp., Inc.</i> , No. 98 Civ. 77661, 2006 WL 3342655, at *2 (S.D.N.Y. Nov. 16, 2006)	18
<i>Am. Home Prods. Corp. v. Johnson & Johnson</i> , 577 F.2d 160 (2d Cir. 1978)	10
<i>Ames Pub. Co. v. Walker-Davis Pubs., Inc.</i> , 372 F. Supp. 1, 14 -15 (E.D. Pa. 1974)	18
<i>BP Chems. Ltd. v. Formosa Chem. & Fibre Corp.</i> , 229 F.3d 254, 264 (3d. Cir. 2000)	19
<i>Cashmere & Camel Hair Mfrs. Institute v. Saks Fifth Ave.</i> , 284 F.3d 302, 316-17 (1st Cir. 2002)	11
<i>Castrol Inc. v. Quaker State Corp.</i> , 977 F.2d 57, 63 (2d Cir. 1992)	9
<i>Castrol Inc.</i> , 977 F.2d at 63; <i>see also McNeil-P.C.C.</i> , 938 F.2d at 1549	9
<i>Church & Dwight Co. v. S.C. Johnson & Son, Inc.</i> , 873 F. Supp. 893, 904-05 (D.N.J. 1994)	17
<i>Ciba Vision Corp.</i> , 348 F. Supp. 2d at 185	23
<i>Coca Cola</i> , 690 F.2d at 316	20
<i>Coca-Cola Co. v. Tropicana Prods., Inc.</i> , 538 F. Supp. 1091, 1096 (S.D.N.Y.), <i>rev'd on other grounds</i> , 690 F.2d 312 (2d Cir. 1982)	12
<i>Conopco, Inc. v. Campbell Soup Co.</i> , 95 F.3d 187, 192 (2d Cir. 1996)	19
<i>County School Bd. of Henrico County, Va. v. RT</i> , 433 F. Supp. 2d 692, 704 (E.D. Va. 2006)	14
<i>County School Board</i> , 433. F. Supp. 2d at 704-706	15
<i>Cuisinarts, Inc. v. Robot-Coupe Int'l Corp.</i> , No. 81 Div. 731, 1982 WL 121559, at *2 (S.D.N.Y. June 9, 1982)	12
<i>DIRECTV</i> , 497 F.3d at 161	20
<i>Fisher-Price, Inc. v. Well-Made Toy Mfg. Corp.</i> , 25 F.3d 119, 124-25 (2d Cir. 1994)	19
<i>Gillette Co. v. Norelco Consumer Prods. Co.</i> , 946 F. Supp. 115 (D. Mass. 1996)	9
<i>Healthpoint</i> , 273 F. Supp. 2d at 794-95	18

<i>Id.</i> at 9	12
<i>IGT v. Alliance Gaming Corp.</i> , No. 2:04-CV-1676-RCJ-RJJ, 2007 WL 911773, at *12 (D. Nev. March 22, 2007)	11
<i>Johnson & Johnson v. Carter-Wallace, Inc.</i> , 631 F.2d 186, 190 (2d Cir. 1980).....	19
<i>Johnson & Johnson Vision Care, Inc. v. Ciba Vision Corp.</i> , 348 F. Supp. 2d 165, 170 (S.D.N.Y. 2004).....	8
<i>Johnson & Johnson-Merck Consumer Pharms. Co. v. Smithkline Beecham Corp.</i> , 960 F.2d 294, 298-299 (2d Cir. 1992).....	11
<i>Keystone Driller Co. v. Gen. Excavator Co.</i> , 290 U.S. 240, 245 (1933).....	18
<i>L&F Prods. v. The Procter & Gamble, Co.</i> , 845 F. Supp. 984 (S.D.N.Y. 1994).....	17
<i>Linotype Co. v. Varityper, Inc.</i> , No. 89 CIV. 4747(MJL), 1989 WL 94338, at *3 (S.D.N.Y. Aug. 4, 1989).....	23
<i>McNeil-P.C.C., Inc. v. Bristol-Myers Squibb Co.</i> , 938 F.2d 1544, 1549 (2d Cir. 1991).....	9
<i>National Geographic Society v. Conde Nast Publications</i> , 687 F.Supp. 106, 110 (S.D.N.Y.1988)	22
<i>Novartis</i> 129 F. Supp. 2d 368	19
<i>Novartis Consumer Health v. Johnson & Johnson-Merck Consumer Pharms., Co.</i> , 290 F.3d 578, 594 (3d Cir. 2002)	12
<i>Pfizer</i> , 868 F. Supp. at 461.....	23
<i>Pfizer, Inc. v. Miles, Inc.</i> , 868 F. Supp. 437, 449 (D. Conn. 1994)	8
<i>Playtex Prods., Inc. v. Gerber Prods. Co.</i> , 981 F. Supp. 827 (S.D.N.Y. 1997)	17
<i>Resource Developers, Inc. v. Statue of Liberty-Ellis Island Found., Inc.</i> , 926 F.2d 134, 140 (2d Cir. 1991)	11
<i>Rhone-Poulenc Rorer Pharms, Inc., v. Marion Merrell Dow, Inc.</i> , 93 F.3d 511, 516 (8th Cir. 1996).....	23
<i>Satis Vacuum Indus. Vertriebs, AG v. Optovision Tech., Inc.</i> , No. CIV. A. 399CV2147-M, 2001 WL 1142803 (N.D. Tex. Sept. 24, 2001).....	14
<i>Schick Mfg., Inc. v. Gillette Co.</i> , 372 F. Supp. 2d 273, 284 (D. Conn. 2005)	19
<i>SmithKline Beecham Consumer Healthcare, L.P. v. Johnson & Johnson-Merck Consumer Pharms. Co.</i> , 906 F. Supp. 178, 188 (S.D.N.Y. 1995).....	17

<i>SmithKline</i> , 906 F. Supp. at 181	12
<i>Spalding Sports Worldwide, Inc. v. Wilson Sporting Goods Co.</i> , 198 F. Supp. 2d 59 (D. Mass. 2002) (golf balls)	17
<i>Time Warner Cable, Inc. v. DIRECTV, Inc.</i> , 497 F.3d 144, 153 (2d Cir. 2007)	8
<i>Tri-Star Pictures, Inc. v. Leisure Time Prods., B.V.</i> , 17 F.3d 38, 44 (2d Cir. 1994)	19
<i>U-Haul Int’l, Inc. v. Jartran, Inc.</i> , 522 F. Supp. 1238, 1255 (D. Ariz. 1981)	17
<i>U-Haul</i> , 522 F. Supp. at 1254-55	17
<i>United States v. Premo Pharm. Labs. Inc.</i> , 511 F. Supp. 958, 985-86 (D.N.J. 1981)	17
<i>Vidal Sassoon, Inc. v. Bristol-Myers Co.</i> , 661 F.2d 272 (2d Cir. 1981)	10
<i>Zeneca Inc. v. Eli Lilly and Co.</i> , No. 99 CIV. 1452, 1999 WL 509471, *31 (S.D.N.Y. July 19, 1999)	8
<i>Zeneca</i> , 1999 WL 509471, at *42	23

**CONTENTS OF THIS DOCUMENT TO
BE FILED UNDER SEAL**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The foregoing PLAINTIFF THE PROCTER & GAMBLE COMPANY'S PRE-TRIAL BRIEF was served on all counsel of record on December 12, 2007 by electronic mail through the Court's CM/ECF system.

/s/ Laura W. Sawyer